

# PROJECT MUSE<sup>®</sup>

Decolonial Temporality in Alfredo Jaar's *The Kissinger Project* 

Florencia San Martín

ASAP/Journal, Volume 4, Number 2, May 2019, pp. 345-376 (Article)

Published by Johns Hopkins University Press *DOI: https://doi.org/10.1353/asa.2019.0032* 



➡ For additional information about this article https://muse.jhu.edu/article/731643 Florencia San Martín

# DECOLONIAL TEMPORALITY IN ALFREDO JAAR'S *THE KISSINGER PROJECT*

From Heraclitus to Karl von Clausewitz and Henry Kissinger, "war is the origin of everything."

—Enrique Dussel<sup>1</sup>

*I n* 1984, two years after moving from Chile to New York, ALFREDO JAAR (b. Santiago, Chile, 1956) created Searching for K, an archive made out of appropriated pages of books.

11

FLORENCIA SAN MARTÍN holds a Ph.D. in Art History from Rutgers University. Her research has been supported by the Patricia and Phillip Frost Fellowship at the Smithsonian American Art Museum, the Louis Bevier Dissertation Completion Fellowship from Rutgers, Rutgers' Center for the Critical Analysis, and the Chilean Commission for Scientific and Technological Research (CONICYT). Florencia is the New York Editor of Art Nexus, and is currently co-editing with Dr. Tatiana E. Flores a special issue on Contemporary Latin American Art for Arts, a peer-reviewed open access journal published by MDP. Her book project, The Decolonial Project of Alfredo Jaar, reframes Jaar's art as decolonial critique of the catastrophic humanitarian and epistemological consequences of neoliberalism, a capitalist economic project and ideological outlook that defines our present moment globally. Compiled of photographic reproductions and their corresponding captions from the first two volumes of Henry Kissinger's memoirs (published separately in 1979 and 1982), *Searching for K* exposes a twofold political, historical, and cultural phenomenon.<sup>2</sup> On the one hand, it makes visible Kissinger's central role during his tenure as U.S. National Security Advisor and Secretary of State under Presidents Richard Nixon and Gerald Ford (1969–1977) in plotting the overthrow of Chilean democracy and engendering the dictatorship that followed (1973–1990). On the other hand, it highlights

> ASAP/Journal, Vol. 4.2 (2019): 345-376 © 2019 Johns Hopkins University Press.



#### Figure 1.

Alfredo Jaar, Searching for K (1984). Eighteen panels (13% × 32½ in. / 34 × 81.6 cm) and one pigment print (14 × 16 in. / 35.6 × 40.6 cm). Courtesy the artist, New York (image of the work in full page, as suggested by the artist).

ASAP/Journal 346 /

the fact that efforts to denounce Kissinger for crimes against humanity had hitherto failed. When Jaar made the work, Kissinger was not only a free man, but also a political figure who wielded significant political and economic power and even moral authority.<sup>3</sup> For Jaar, the work of denunciation was therefore an ongoing project that had to continue until Kissinger could be brought to justice for his human rights violations and the other political, social, and economic repercussions from his oversight of imperial interventions into Latin American politics. Jaar represents this twofold historical, cultural, and political phenomenon—that is, Kissinger's accountability for crimes against humanity and the fact that he has not yet been punished legally. By intervening in images and texts regarding Kissinger, and by organizing these images and texts in a conceptually specific manner, Jaar's aim is to expose Kissinger's crimes and the fact that he has not yet paid retribution for them.

Jaar's use of language is a key conceptual strategy for this twofold aim. The use of a present participle in the title of the work, for instance, indicates the extent to which the task of the artwork is unfinished, incomplete, and in process. As a linguistic decision representing an action happening in the present, Jaar's "searching" speaks of a task that is underway, rather than resolved. Indeed, this task is what motivates Jaar's larger series for which Searching for K was made. Titled The Kissinger Project, Jaar's ongoing series is itself a decolonial project that exposes the conceptual continuity of modernity's coloniality of power in current social orders and forms of knowledge from the starting point of Kissinger's interventionism. A global paradigm, first taking shape with the conquest of the Americas, colonial modernity began with the "constitution of a new world order culminating, five hundred years later, in a global power covering the whole planet," as the late Peruvian sociologist Aníbal Quijano explains; modernity's matrix of power has remained the same ever since.<sup>4</sup> By this logic, independence does not undo coloniality. As Quijano and Immanuel Wallerstein put it: independence "it merely transformed its outer form."<sup>5</sup> The task of decoloniality thus remains unfinished.

Decoloniality is a way of doing, thinking, and being that challenges modernity's progressive notion of historical time. As literary critic Walter D. Mignolo explains, the Western project of modernity emerged in the sixteenth century as a simultaneous colonization of both time and space: the colonization of time through the invention of the Middle Ages in the process of conceptualizing

San Martín 347 /

the Renaissance, and the colonization of space by means of the conquest of the New World.<sup>6</sup> A project with "cumulative" rather than "successive" phases, as Mignolo tellingly puts it, modernity names a persistent historical practice of destruction and revision.<sup>7</sup> On account of this cumulative historical logic, the project of decolonialization, which has existed since the very inception of modernity in the sixteenth century, and its darker side, coloniality, functions no less persistently as a necessary task that remains unfinished.<sup>8</sup> With this operative notion of incompleteness in mind, in this article I argue that Jaar's *The Kissinger Project* interrupts both concepts and forms associated with modernity's progressive conception of time—a time that is mirrored in Henry Kissinger's realpolitik—and that Jaar challenges this conception of time through a project that is essentially incomplete.

#### I. AN INCOMPLETE PROJECT; AN INCOMPLETE CASE

Jaar's pursuit is as urgent today as it was in 1984, when he created *Searching for K*. Not only do Kissinger's crimes against humanity remain unpunished, but Kissinger's legacy still actively shapes Chile's neoliberal economic, political, and cultural paradigm. For over 30 years, Jaar has continued to create works about Kissinger that denounce the former Secretary of State's role in the Chilean conflict and post-conflict history, and that continue to pursue the fact that justice has not yet been achieved. In 1999, when the U.S. declassified thousands of formerly secret documents demonstrating Kissinger's catastrophic intervention in Chile—an unprecedented release that followed Pinochet's detention in London for crimes against humanity—many investigations regarding Kissinger

# "

For over 30 years, Jaar has continued to create works about Kissinger that denounce the former Secretary of State's role in the Chilean conflict and postconflict history . . . one brought by the family of Chilean military commander René Schneider.<sup>9</sup> A firm opponent of the U.S. plan to intervene in the elections, Schneider was kidnapped by CIA operations in Chile and then assassinated on October 25, 1970 by Chilean groups.<sup>10</sup>

came to light, including lawsuits such as the

This and other lawsuits failed and have continued to fail. "[T]he U.S. government [has] preferred not to rattle Cold War alliances," wrote a journalist in a recent article on

ASAP/Journal 348 /

**J** 

Kissinger's current influence in domestic affairs granted through his Cold War foreign policies.<sup>11</sup> More recently, additional documents have been declassified and further denunciations have been voiced, including political condemnation and public protests. In February and March 2016, for instance, at the Democratic presidential primary debates in Milwaukee and Miami, Senator Bernie Sanders blamed his rival, Hillary Clinton, for "getting the approval or the support or the mentoring of Henry Kissinger," whom Sanders described as "one of the most destructive secretaries of state in modern history" and who was responsible for the "overthrow [of] the government of Salvador Allende in Chile."<sup>12</sup> And in October 2018, when Kissinger was invited by NYU's Stern School of Business to speak about his diplomatic career, a woman in the audience stood and said, "Henry Kissinger, you have blood in your hands. What about your role in Chile, what about the Chilean people?"<sup>13</sup>

Even in 2019, Kissinger, at the age of 96, remains a key strategist in the realm of international affairs. He advises both the Republican and Democratic establishments; he publishes widely on current foreign policies; and "his impressive achievements [and] career of extraordinary effectiveness," as three Harvard professors have recently written, are significant "lessons for today's negotia-tors."<sup>14</sup> And Jaar, in response, has continued making works about Kissinger. For example, in 2012, on the thirty-ninth anniversary of the Chilean coup, Jaar, in collaboration with the European Center for Constitutional and Human Rights (ECCHR), punctuated the pages of three major Berlin newspapers with a series of advertisements sporting the phrase "Arrest Kissinger!" (Figure 2).

Along with German and English versions of the text, the ads also appeared in Spanish, Laotian, Khmer, Portuguese, and a Timorese dialect, the languages of the people living in countries affected by Kissinger's realpolitik. "And for these policies [Kissinger] is still lauded by many today," writes ECCHR founder and General Secretary Wolfgang Kaleck.<sup>15</sup> Proceeding from the case of Chile, Jaar here connects shared histories of civic repression and human rights violations perpetuated by the U.S. throughout the so-called Third World.

For more than three decades, Jaar's project on Kissinger has been exposing Kissinger's crimes from the vantage point of Chile.<sup>16</sup> In so doing, Jaar's project has been engaged in the ongoing decolonial task of denouncing modernity/ coloniality embracing a decolonial position that states, in Quijano's words, that

San Martín 349 /



#### Figure 2.

Alfredo Jaar, The Kissinger Project (Berlin) (2012). Thirteen individual newspaper pages: TAZ (18½ × 12½ in. / 47 × 31.75 cm); Berliner Zeitung (20¼ × 13¼ in. / 51.5 × 35 cm); Der Tagesspiegel (22½ × 15¾ in. / 57.15 × 40 cm). Courtesy of the artist.

"Vivimos adentro, pero en contra" [We live inside it, but against it].<sup>17</sup> Focusing on the colonization of time, which has generated disastrous humanitarian crises worldwide in the name of "progress" and "development," Jaar's Kissinger series makes visible the consequences of modernity-coloniality's linear temporality during and after the Chilean regime. It also makes visible the continuity of this catastrophic model in U.S.-Latin American relationships today, considering, for instance, the Central American migrant crisis (whose roots are found in U.S. intervention in Central America in the last decade of the Cold War), and recent U.S. imperialist political interventions in countries such as Honduras

# "

Focusing on the colonization of time, which has generated disastrous humanitarian crises worldwide in the name of "progress" and "development," Jaar's Kissinger series makes visible the consequences of modernity-coloniality's linear temporality during and after the Chilean regime.

**J** 

ASAP/Journal 350 /

and Venezuela. As the late art critic Dore Ashton, at the age of 87, told Jaar in a film he made about her in 2015: "What happened you know . . . horrible story . . . and definitely Kissinger is the villain, in my opinion . . . but people still don't say that, do they?"<sup>18</sup> Ashton's question speaks to the contingency of Jaar's ongoing project on Kissinger, and of its potential to intervene in the public's consciousness. In Jaar's work, Kissinger's villainy is no longer unspoken, and his historical agency is never in question.

As mentioned above, Jaar's body of work on Kissinger is grouped together under the aggregate title *The Kissinger Project*. The series is comprised of appropriated documents, including pages from published books, declassified archives, print media, signed letters, and autographed portraits related to Kissinger. Concurrently with the launch of his artistic career in New York in 1983, Jaar began making artwork investigating Henry Kissinger with a work titled *Buscando a Kissinger* [*Searching for Kissinger*] (1983), completed a year before he made *Searching for K*.



Figure 3.

Alfredo Jaar, Buscando a Kissinger (1983). Collage on postcard, 31/2 × 51/2 in. / 8.9 × 14 cm. Courtesy of the artist.

San Martín 351 /

I will delve further into this work below. For now, what it is important to note here, just as in *Searching for K*, is that the use of a present participle in the title of the work in Spanish also embraces the unfinished task of Jaar's entire series.

At stake in *The Kissinger Project* is the artist's simultaneous critique of the mainstream media and celebration of critical journalism, a key aspect of his art at large. Informed by a variety of archival and current media sources, Jaar's series looks at the Chilean conflict as a point of departure for addressing the cases of other so-called Third World countries affected by U.S. imperialist practices during and after the Cold War, and he does so from a perspective that is essentially unfinished, incomplete, just like the project of decoloniality itself. To elaborate on this point, I will center on Jaar's *Searching for K* (1984) for two reasons: first, because it was the first time Jaar appropriated an iconic photograph that has become representative of both the U.S. intervention in Chile and its aftermath; and second, because it is exemplary of the political conditions that propelled Jaar to begin his series on Kissinger. Jaar's project makes visible the contingency of the traumatic past in a context dominated by rampant neoliberalism.

#### II. AN IMPERIAL HANDSHAKE

In Searching for K, Jaar uses a red marker and an architectural stencil with circular apertures to intervene directly in the pages with photographic reproductions taken from the first two volumes of Kissinger's memoirs. A metaphor for photography's essence-famously described by Roland Barthes as an index indicating that "this has been," that is, a testimony of reality-this simple intervention by Jaar indicates evidence of a presence: that this happened, and that Kissinger was there.<sup>19</sup> Tracing perfect rings of different diameters and thicknesses around Kissinger's head, Jaar creates graphic contrasts between monochrome and color, and between mechanical and manual procedures. He does not cut the photographic images from the books but rather uses the entire pages containing them. The texts accompanying each photographic reproduction of Kissinger shown with key political figures, family members, and celebrities worldwide are also included in the work. Identifying Kissinger's place in each image, Jaar's red circles deploy their insistent testimonial function as a disruption of the self-evidence or even banality of each photograph. Noting the absence of any photograph or caption related to Chile, a country that occupies two extensive chapters in Kissinger's memoirs and where he met with Pinochet in 1976, Jaar

added a photograph of that meeting as a telltale supplement to Kissinger's carefully curated self-portraiture.

Shot from below, the black-andwhite photograph depicts Kissinger shaking hands with General Augusto Pinochet. Both figures are dressed in their iconic attire: Pinochet is in a military uniform and Kissinger wears a dark suit and sports his signature thick-rimmed glasses. Two guards are positioned in the background; one looks at Kissinger, while the other looks at the camera. The image freezes a moment of warm exchange





between the Chilean dictator and the U.S. Secretary of State; Pinochet displays a slight smile and seems to be saying something to Kissinger, who smiles back at the general. The pivotal historical and symbolic consequence of this meeting for the dictatorship and the post-dictatorship future of Latin America is one of the main points Jaar addresses in *The Kissinger Project*. Extracted from its original source and placed along other press records celebrating Kissinger's kindness, polite behavior, and leadership, the photograph in *Searching for K* functions both to convey information and to testify to Henry Kissinger's hypocrisy and opportunism, documenting his complicity with the regime as a means of protecting U.S. corporate interests in Chile.

The image first appeared in the June 21, 1976 issue of *TIME* accompanying an article by John Dinges, a special correspondent in Chile from 1972 to 1980 for *TIME*, the *Washington Post*, and ABC Radio. The main focus of the article was Kissinger's unprecedented move of cautioning the Pinochet regime on its human rights violations, the strongest admonition that the secretary had ever made in his career.<sup>20</sup> In Dinges's article, accordingly titled "A Harsh Warning on Human Rights," he writes: "When Chile's military government asked to play host to last week's annual meeting in Santiago of the Organization of American States [OAS], the junta hoped the occasion might be a good chance to change its widespread image as the most repressive regime on the continent.

San Martín 353 /

No such luck."<sup>21</sup> It is striking, to say the least, that a photograph connoting empathy between Kissinger and Pinochet would be chosen to illustrate an article describing an *admonition* of human rights violations in Chile and the eventual consequences of such crimes in the international community. Jaar's appropriation of this image in *Searching for K* exploits this irony in confronting the documentary trail of Kissinger's own human rights violations with this striking image of complicity.

Kissinger's meeting with Pinochet on June 8, 1976 took place at the height of the regime's repression, as the officers of the Chilean National Intelligence Directorate (DINA) were actively engaged in torturing and disappearing political opponents in and beyond Chilean detention camps. The meeting took place in the presidential suite of the Diego Portales building, an emblematic highrise in downtown Santiago that was used for governmental operations while La Moneda Palace was being repaired from a bombing on the date of the coup. It was scheduled for the day before Kissinger's speech (ironically, on human rights) at the Sixth Annual Assembly of the OAS in Santiago. In a "carefully calculated response to the main topic of the [OAS] meeting, a report on the hemisphere by the Inter-American Human Rights Commission detailing allegations of violations by 16 nations," Kissinger publicly warned the Chilean junta that "the condition of human rights has impaired our relationship with Chile and will continue to do so. Human rights are the very essence of a meaningful life, and human dignity is the ultimate purpose of government. A government that tramples on the rights of its citizens denies the purpose of its existence."22 By contrast, the transcript of Kissinger's private meeting with Pinochet the day before points to the documentary trail that testifies to Kissinger's complicity with the violences of the regime. Utterly contradicting his speech at the OAS, Kissinger told the General,

I have a strong feeling of friendship in Chile. . . . In the United States, as you know, we are sympathetic with what you are trying to do here. . . . In my statement [at the OAS] I will treat human rights in general terms. . . . The speech is not aimed at Chile. I wanted to tell you about this. My evaluation is that you are a victim of all left-wing groups around the world, and that your greatest sin was that you overthrew a government which was going Communist.<sup>23</sup>

As the memorandum of their conversation suggests, Kissinger was giving the green light to Pinochet's regime, while his OAS speech was a diplomatic screen

to cover the true purpose of his visit to Chile. In fact, it was Kissinger himself who encouraged OAS representatives to choose Santiago for their annual meeting. "I knew it would add prestige to Chile. I came for that reason," he told Pinochet, considering that in the climate of a hemispheric diplomatic gathering they could meet naturally.<sup>24</sup> This would prevent the U.S. Congress's suspicion of Kissinger's support for Pinochet in light of the embargo of U.S. arms to the Chilean regime that had been passed by Congress as the Kennedy Amendment

four months earlier. Jaar's inclusion of this photograph in his archive exposes not only Kissinger's direct support of Pinochet's regime, but also Kissinger's aim of keeping the content of this meeting secret. The photographic logic of *Searching for K* functions as an apparatus for political and historical accounting; Jaar reveals what Kissinger hides. Years later, preoccupied by Pinochet's 1998 detention in London for crimes against humanity and the release by the Clinton administration of more than 24,000 secret documents the following year that included a memo of their 1976 meeting,

# "

The photographic logic of Searching for K functions as an apparatus for political and historical accounting; Jaar reveals what Kissinger hides.

### **J**J

Kissinger wrote and published his third and last memoir fearing he could also be brought up on charges. Contradicting his words to Pinochet in order to highlight the "challenges" of his "human rights" speech at the OAS, Kissinger stated: "As *fate* would have it, the meeting was planned to be held in Santiago. . . . Neither Ford nor I considered it desirable to run from the challenge."<sup>25</sup>

However, not only had Kissinger himself planned that the OAS meeting be held in Santiago, as he told Pinochet; but the private meeting documented by Jaar in *Searching for K* was also well documented in the Chilean press. Despite the content of the meeting remaining classified until its formal declassification in 1999, it was hardly a secret. A day after the June 1976 meeting, the conservative right-wing and government-friendly *El Mercurio* published written and visual information about it. Emphasizing Kissinger's "sympathy" for Pinochet, headlines for such reports read, "*Con Promesa de Amor se nos va Kissinger*" [With Promise of Love, Kissinger Leaves Us], and contained such captions as "*Una cordial reunion sostuvieron ayer Augusto Pinochet y el secretario de estado norteamericano Henry Kissinger*" [Augusto Pinochet and U.S. Secretary of State Henry Kissinger Had a Cordial Meeting Yesterday].<sup>26</sup>

Alfredo Jaar was certainly aware of the 1976 Kissinger-Pinochet gathering and the celebratory press around it when it happened.<sup>27</sup> Indeed, Jaar's well-known fascination with the media and with the information provided by it served as a point of departure for his critical thinking long before the event. As he describes this evolution,

[M]y father was also a great reader of news. I saw him every morning *religiously* starting the day reading his paper. . . . That became a kind of model for me: the need to know. . . . Information became a key aspect of my life from the very beginning. That is why I started subscribing to magazines and newspapers, from around the world, in many languages, because of this passion, this obsession with information. . . . I became aware very early on of the mechanisms of the media, and I learned very early on how to read the media. . . . I immediately realized that the way these events were described differed greatly depending on the source.<sup>28</sup>

In a manner that Jaar's work would critically expose, the laudatory articles in *El Mercurio* often celebrated Kissinger's persona as both a political international leader and celebrity. He was portrayed triumphantly in biographies and shown as a celebrity who, along with his wife Nancy, was welcomed by more than 3,000 enthusiastic Chileans.<sup>29</sup> A similar reception took place on National Television (TVN), which documented Kissinger's visit by celebrating his *"extraordinaria posición como canciller del mundo*" [extraordinary position as a chancellor of the world]. "Here, on Chilean soil, is the great U.S. Secretary of State," marveled one journalist, reporting on Kissinger's arrival at the Santiago airport, asking attendees: "Did you imagine him this way? What did you think about his outfit?"<sup>30</sup> Kissinger, for Chileans supporting the regime, was "the most important celebrity to ever come to the country in years."<sup>31</sup> And television, which during the dictatorship not only censored information but also turned it into a spectacle, was a key axis of the regime's cultural intervention.<sup>32</sup>

#### III. MAKING THE ECONOMY SCREAM

Because TVN was controlled by the Army, and the news media—concentrated in the ultra-conservative *El Mercurio*—was controlled by the regime and its supporters, such laudatory broadcasts and reports are not surprising. Regarding

ASAP/Journal 356 /

the enthusiastic tone of the press about the supposedly secret meeting, a memorandum of the conversation partially released in 1999 demonstrates that the celebration of Kissinger was part of a broader anti-communist propaganda effort undertaken by El Mercurio's owner Agustín Edwards that began in the late 1960s.<sup>33</sup> Fearing for the future of his Chilean assets in the wake of the socialist agenda of the Popular Unity, the Kissinger-Edwards program reached its pinnacle after Allende was democratically elected president on September 4, 1970.34 In fact, Kissinger himself arranged a meeting between Edwards and former CIA director Richard Helms, whose name was previously crossed out of declassified documents to protect his identity as a confidential source.<sup>35</sup> Kissinger, despite the recommendation of his deputy at the National Security Council (NSC), Viron Vaky, that plotting a coup in Chile was "patently a violation of our own principles and policy tenets" considering that Allende's "threat" to the U.S. was "hard to argue," supported Edwards's idea for "a conspiracy for a coup d'é tat and how the United States could support it."36 In fact, the resulting Edwards-Helms gathering on September 14 was key to the destabilizing action taken by the Nixon administration against Allende.<sup>37</sup> Hence, it is no coincidence that the next day, in a 15-minute meeting with Kissinger at the Oval Office, Nixon famously ordered Helms to "make the [Chilean] economy scream."38

"Mak[ing] the economy scream" resulted in a radical intervention centered on lowering the value of copper-the pillar of the Chilean economy-and on financing media propaganda manipulation to interfere with the public opinion regarding the Chilean economic crisis. This was the main plan of CIA covert actions whose principal aim was to prevent Allende from coming to power or, once he was already in power, to remove him from the presidency. While the first coup attempt in 1970 failed and the second in 1973 succeeded, the overall plan resulted in numerous strikes and a highly polarized country, and was thus pivotal for the implementation of a dictatorship.<sup>39</sup> A State of Siege scenario served to implement a fusion of the regime with the imposition of free market economics, in Chile and throughout the region. As Chilean sociologist José Joaquín Brunner observed, the dictatorship's role was to "maintain the order adequate to the new model of capitalist development."40 Furthermore, as cultural critic and literary theorist Idelber Avelar notes, "the imbrication between the doctrine of national security and the translational market . . . between, in a word, political authoritarianism and capitalist class interest."41 As he further explains:

Far from exceptional aberrations, the Latin American dictatorships of the 1970s and 1980s should be seen as instruments of a refoundational project on the part of national and international elites, or as I will call it, an epochal transition that closes the cycle of the modern liberal and populist states in the region and ushers in the third, telematics and planetary phase of capital.<sup>42</sup>

But before delving deeper into the relation between Jaar's project and the dictatorship's continuity with neoliberalism—that is, between Jaar's project on Henry Kissinger and the fact that the Chilean dictatorship, like the colonial project of modernity that began with the Conquest in the sixteenth century, continues to take its toll—what is at stake here is Edwards's direct involvement in CIA covert actions and, by extension, the role of *El Mercurio* in embracing the 1973 coup and the dictatorship that followed.

What motivated Jaar to create his project on Kissinger in early 1980s New York? Jaar arrived in New York in the context of the solidarity movement in Central and Latin America, from which a large number of critical practices and discourses toward U.S. interventionist practices before and during the Reagan administration emerged. One central source for Jaar's pursuit of Kissinger was Seymour M. Hersh's *The Price of Power: Kissinger in the Nixon White House* (1983). Published one year after Jaar's move to the city, Hirsch's book was the first journalistic response in the U.S. to Kissinger's memoir and received wide attention and mixed reviews for its revision of the memoir's deceptive self-mythologization.<sup>43</sup> A crucial revelation, for instance, regarding Kissinger's condescending and neocolonialist attitude toward Chile and Latin America was his dismissive treatment of Chilean Foreign Minister Gabriel Valdés. During a June 1969 meeting of Latin American ambassadors at the White House Kissinger disparages the Global South as an utterly insignificant historical entity. Responding to Valdés's complaint about the inherently exploitative nature of U.S. assistance in Latin America, Kissinger replied:

You come here speaking of Latin America, but this is not important. Nothing important can come from the South. History has never been produced in the South. The axis of history starts in Moscow, goes to Bonn, crosses over to Washington, and then goes to Tokyo. What happens in the South is of no importance. You're wasting your time.<sup>44</sup>

How could Kissinger's friendship with Chile and Latin America, as depicted by the Chilean media in 1976, possibly be explained? Jaar asked himself this in 1984 while comparing Kissinger's memoirs with Chilean press records and *The Price of Power*. In *Latin America* (1984), Jaar reproduces Kissinger's words on a typewritten sheet of paper dominated by a rectangular black space (Figure 5). In bringing to light Kissinger's statements, Jaar dramatizes the historical erasure at stake in their enactment as policy.

Below the text, Jaar adds the name of the author and the date in which this author pronounced these words, writing: "Henry Kissinger, 1969." At the center of the sheet, the black rectangle represents censorship, lack of information, hidden transnational operations.<sup>45</sup> It also represents a dictatorial state in a region which, according to Kissinger, was "not important." Jaar both exposes and resists the idea of a "Latin America" whose culture and identity depends on imperialist multinational interests and whose "history" is "dictated" by colonial power. He exposes and rejects, in short, a colonial idea of "Latin America" framed according to Kissinger's "friendship" and the celebratory accounts of the right-wing Chilean media. This same question about friendship is represented in Jaar's *Searching for K*, where the artist reveals Kissinger's role in the



Alfredo Jaar, Latin America (1984) Paper cutting, typed  $8^{7}_{16}$ " ×  $10^{1}_{2}$ " / 21.4 cm × 10.5 cm Courtesy of the artist.

San Martín 359 /

# Jaar critically exposes not only Kissinger's disastrous intervention in Chile—a singular geopolitical case—but also the paradigm from which Kissinger operates: that of the modern world system.

## **J**J

Chilean conflict as well as the fact that Kissinger doggedly concealed that role. Jaar's work effects a twofold disclosure that finds its conceptual framework at the heart of the decolonial project whereby, as Mignolo has stated, "' modernity' is a European narrative that hides its darker side, 'coloniality.'"<sup>46</sup> In this sense, Jaar critically exposes not only Kissinger's disastrous intervention in Chile—a singular geopolitical case—but also the paradigm from which Kissinger operates: that of the modern world system.

In Searching for K, Jaar likewise calls attention to this paradigm through his technique of drawing red circles around Kissinger's head in each appropriated photograph. Recalling a well-known method of identification used by legal organizations, this tactic for recognizing victimizers is also a metaphor for the testimonial feature of photojournalism famously described by Barthes as an index indicating that "this has been."47 In persistently repeating this tactic throughout his archive, from beginning to end, Jaar's aggregation of red circles discloses Kissinger's intentions: his art of persuading the readers and viewers of popular media that he (Kissinger) is the protagonist and the hero of these moments. Kissinger carefully selected only those photographs in which he is shown in the right place, at the right time, and with the right people. In documenting Kissinger's presence as both protagonist and criminal, Jaar's work indicates how Kissinger created a linear narrative of U.S. international affairs through the thread of his own "achievements," embodying modernity's progressive, universal, heroic aesthetics, and its tendency to erase the histories of traumatic forgotten pasts. Jaar's red circle thus highlights the idea of truth, authorship, and universality from the perspective of Henry Kissinger. This is why there is always a circle when Kissinger is present, as his presence, according to Kissinger, always presumes a meaning of victory, development: a narrative, that is, of imperial modernity. And this is also why there is no circle to draw when Kissinger is

ASAP/Journal 360 /

"

absent—as is the case of 25 photographs out of the total 158. Through his intervention of the red circle, Jaar both discloses and subverts Kissinger's recourse to laudatory memorialization, and, by extension, that of modernity as well; in doing so, as we will see, Jaar also makes visible how such memorialization and its reproduction in the mainstream media and in Kissinger's own accounts serve to hide, erase, and also abet atrocity.

Jaar invokes such erasures by juxtaposing Kissinger's diplomatic photographs with this second set of images that depict incidents of defeat and shame. In Jaar's work, these images appear without the telltale red circles because Kissinger is not present. Such is the case of a August 9, 1974 image that shows Nixon departing the White House after resigning from the presidency over the Watergate scandal.<sup>48</sup> A vertical reproduction printed as a full-page illustration at the end of Kissinger's second memoir, the image depicts a frowning Nixon, the corners of his lips turned down, covering his face while waving goodbye. This photograph represents is a far cry from Nixon's hallmark victory salute performed at that same moment, thus helping Kissinger to illustrate the opposite paths he and Nixon would follow after Watergate. Whereas Nixon would come to signify a historical legacy of dishonor, downfall, and loneliness, Kissinger's path would instead embrace ethics, integrity, and political power. In his own deployment of visual strategies relying on the indexicality of photography, Kissinger grants

himself a happy ending. Kissinger suggests that neither he nor his values were involved in Watergate; that is, that neither he nor his values were part of such disgraceful activities.

But as Jaar's work makes clear, Kissinger was neither a savior nor a hero, but one of the main architects of the destabilization of the Chilean economy that looked to prevent Allende from assuming the presidency. Kissinger was a key supporter of the bloody coup and dictatorship

# "

In his own deployment of visual strategies relying on the indexicality of photography, Kissinger grants himself a happy ending.

# **J**J

that followed in which thousands died, leaving millions still suffering from the trauma of the regime.<sup>49</sup> Declassified documents and journalistic records demonstrate the extent to which he played such a role. Alfredo Jaar documents not only these facts and their consequences but also the subtle aesthetic and rhetorical

strategies means used by Kissinger to influence public opinion. Jaar's exhaustive documentary reconstruction details how, in some cases, Kissinger reproduces shameful historical moments in which he was not involved (as in the case of Watergate), whereas in others, he simply purges certain historical moments from his account, as if those moments had never happened, or as if he had never been morally and politically present. Such is the case of Chile. According to Kissinger, as he writes in his second volume of memoirs, "[O]ur government had nothing to do with planning his overthrow and no involvement with the plotters. . . . The mythology that the United States relentlessly assaulted Allende after he was installed is the opposite of the truth."50 Unearthing Kissinger's own hidden archive, Jaar's Searching for K demonstrates that Kissinger's account was the mythical inversion, and that the truth was indeed that the US had intervened. And he does so by including the censored photograph of Kissinger shaking hands with Pinochet, in which Kissinger is shown to be in the wrong place, at the wrong time, and with the wrong person. Furthermore, Jaar places this image next to the image from Kissinger's original archive of the defeated Nixon: Jaar thus interrupts Kissinger's triumphalist life story by showing his darker side: the hidden handshake of colonial entanglement.

#### IV. SHAKING THE STATE

"From the beginning," Jaar once said, "I was interested not only in [written] information but also in visual information, in images. Later, I realized that I was interested in the 'politics of images,' although I did not have a name for it at the time."<sup>51</sup> His critique of the mainstream media considers that images "not only respond to political events, but also play an important part in shaping them."<sup>52</sup> Jaar literally shows how "shaping" and the ways in which a universalizing lineal history reproduced by the mainstream media in coalition with the political imperialist establishment interfere in the public's opinion. His decolonial aim is to expose this "shaping" as a political events themselves than to reshape the way such events are figured in and as history. When Jaar interpolates an image absent from Kissinger's memoirs into the former Secretary of State's carefully curated documentary narrative, he remediates the persistent historiographic erasure that renders such events into tools for continual state terror and colonial exploitation. This remediation strategy is also at work in the installation

ASAP/Journal 362 |

# When Jaar interpolates an image absent from Kissinger's memoirs into the former Secretary of State's carefully curated documentary narrative, he remediates the persistent historiographic erasure that renders such events into tools for continual state terror and colonial exploitation.

# **J**J

format of Jaar's archival project, which hinges on the testimonial power of the supplement. For its recent exhibition at the Met Breuer in New York for the "Everything Is Connected: Art and Conspiracy" show (2018), *Searching for* K took the form of three long black tables are isolated in nearly symmetrical rows, featuring under glass the pages extracted from Kissinger's memoirs and imprinted by Jaar with the telltale red circles drawn around Kissinger's head (Figure 6).

At the end of the third row lies a square fourth table containing the 1976 photograph of Kissinger's meeting with Pinochet. By isolating this photograph within



#### Figure 6.

Alfredo Jaar, Searching for K (1984). Eighteen panels ( $13\% \times 32\%$  in. /  $34 \times 81.6$  cm) and one pigment print ( $14 \times 16$  in. /  $35.6 \times 40.6$  cm). Installation at the MET Breuer. Credits: Masahito Ono.

San Martín 363 /

an individual frame on its own table, Jaar makes a jarring distinction between what appears in Kissinger's memoirs and what has been censored, interrupting the symmetry of the rows and exceeding their spatial order. Even without annotation, the image speaks volumes, offering both a metaphor of Kissinger's distorted "truth" and a testimonial document of this distortion; the result, as Christopher Hitchens put it elsewhere, is an installation that "decod[es] the usual relationship between fact and falsehood in Kissinger's ill-crafted memoir."<sup>54</sup>

Beyond their investigation into the memoirs, Jaar's works on Kissinger highlight Kissinger's intervention in Chile from the perspective of the U.S. media, which had closely followed Allende's fourth and successful campaign for presidency in 1969.<sup>55</sup> In the context of the Cold War, the U.S. strategy was to make Americans believe by means of media networks that Allende's Chile was a communist threat to the West. This campaign is featured in Jaar's 1985 contribution to the Kissinger Project, *Untitled (Handshake)*, frames the incriminating photograph of the handshake beneath a series of five covers from *TIME* featuring heroic portraits of Kissinger and Allende (Figure 7).

Ranging from 1969 (when Allende was campaigning for the presidency) through September 1973 (Allende's death as a result of the military coup), the cover series



#### Figure 7.

Alfredo Jaar, Untitled (Handshake) (1985). Six pigment prints, 1 frame: 38½ × 61 in. / 97.8 × 155 cm Courtesy of the artist.

ASAP/Journal 364 |

offers a condensed historical narrative of Kissinger's intervention in Chilean politics, as the sequence proceeds from "Marxist Threat to the Americas" to "The Super Secretary: Ready to Shake the State." Jaar, through his simple yet historically and theoretically grounded gesture of juxtaposing these magazine covers with the photograph of Kissinger's meeting with Pinochet, confirms the extent to which Kissinger could indeed "shake the state." Jaar's sequencing of these images documents the handshake through which Kissinger and, by extension, Nixon designed the conditions for political and social instability in Chile that would eventually lead to the 1973 military coup.

Likely informed, on the one hand, by the same sources he used a year before in *Searching for K*, and, on the other, by the "politics of images" that these covers convey, Jaar creates an alternative historical narrative absent from the individual magazine cover images as well as the various events and narratives of cause and effect recounted in the articles. In providing a synoptic historical narrative, the work proposes that Kissinger's political interventions in Chile not only preceded the coup but also continued throughout the dictatorship and underscored Kissinger's anti-Allende campaign during the regime and in its aftermath. The international news media did its own part in the anti-Allende campaign by positioning "The Super Secretary" as a hero fighting against a red Latin American villain. And that villain—according to the narrative of modernity that Jaar's *Untitled (Handshake)* renders explicit—is always defeated in the end. Jaar's appropriated images demonstrate this foreclosure in presenting the red stains that saturate Allende's portrait as a symbol of the leader's blood and his—and socialism's—fall from power.

As numerous studies have demonstrated, however, Kissinger's real concern in Chile was not ideological but economic.<sup>56</sup> But economic, politics, and the social operate in connection to one another. In the case of Chile, however, the economic factor—that is, the implementation of the free market—was and, to a certain extent, is still detached from critical debates regarding its direct influence within the political and social agenda of the military junta, an agenda that was promoted by the media.<sup>57</sup> And in that agenda, as I have explained, the human rights and the human dignity of millions were systematically violated. As Uruguayan writer Eduardo Galeano once ironically observed, "[Pinochet was] torturing people so prices could be free."<sup>58</sup>

San Martín 365 /

Jaar addresses the economic stakes of both the "anti-Allende" campaign and U.S. state intervention in Latin America in his 1983 work Buscando a Kissinger, which compiles a series of postcards of the most financially and politically symbolic sites in New York City. In this early series, Jaar frames each image or set of images with the words "Buscando a Kissinger" [Searching for Kissinger] emblazoned in bold letters that pronounce its investigation into U.S. state interventions on a building-by-building basis (Figure 3). Once charged with renewed political significance on account of their evidentiary détournement, these souvenir postcards associate Kissinger's international policies with the architectural symbols of U.S. exceptionalism in banking, commerce, and "democracy" alike, such as the Empire State Building, the Statue of Liberty, the World Trade Center, and the Stock Exchange. Some of the sites, such as the Rockefeller Center, bear direct ties to U.S. economic interests in Chile and the Pinochet dictatorship: the Rockefeller family owned Anaconda, a mining company in Chile that figured strongly in Kissinger's and CIA's plans to overthrow Chilean democracy so as to keep such industries in private hands. Since Allende and the Popular Unity promised to nationalize large-scale industries, such as copper, as well as health and educational systems, and redistribute land to the campesinos and the working class, U.S. CEOs warned Kissinger and Nixon of their concerns about their investments and the potential for lost profits.<sup>59</sup> Kissinger reacted to such corporate pressure by orchestrating a coup alongside the financial support of U.S. companies. This program was denounced as early as 1973 by writers for the USLA, the newsletter of the United States Committee for Justice to Latin American Political Prisoners, an organization created in the late 1960s by the North American Congress on Latin America:

[T]he U.S. government, one of the first to extend recognition to the military junta, is preparing huge loans to share up the military government and help carry out its work. A major portion of blame for this deathblow to democratic rights in Chile must be assigned to the U.S. government and corporations which, as reveled by the publication of secret ITT memos, were involved in covert sabotage of the Allende regime.<sup>60</sup>

It is thus no coincidence that in Kissinger's 1976 meeting with Pinochet, at which the dictator made clear that "we [Chileans] are behind you [Kissinger]. You are the leader," their handshake amounted to more than an official recognition of the military junta by the United States government. Rather, as Jaar's

ASAP/Journal 366 |

work aims to remind its viewers, it amounted to a neoliberal accord between the state and corporate interests.

It is worth recalling here that the photograph Jaar uses to document this accord was published as an illustration to an investigation of the Pinochet regime's human rights violations in TIME, accompanying an article by John Dinges. Dinges was a cofounder of Revista APSI in 1976, one of the first opposition magazines in Chile.<sup>61</sup> He was also the first to conduct a journalistic investigation on the assassination of Orlando Letelier, a foreign minister who served under President Salvador Allende and a vocal critic of Pinochet. Letelier, while living in exile in the U.S., was killed in a car bombing that was orchestrated under Operation Condor in Washington, D.C. in September 1976.62 The biggest international crime in U.S. soil before 9/11, Letelier's assassination precipitated the renaming of DINA as CNI (National Information Center) and the firing of its head, Colonel Manuel Contreras, who was sentenced by the Chilean court in the post-dictatorship period for this and other crimes.<sup>63</sup> However, the release of a series of declassified documents during the Obama administration in 2015 reveals that Pinochet directly ordered the killing of Letelier.64 Indeed, during his meeting with Kissinger, Pinochet expressed concern about Letelier, who was not only a human rights advocate with close ties to U.S. Congress, but also the first vocal advocate in the U.S. to publicly expose the ties between the dictatorship and the implementation of neoliberalism in Chile.65 "Repression for the majorities and 'economic freedom' for small privileged groups are two sides of the same coin," Letelier wrote in an article for The Nation published a month before his assassination. Dinges and the TIME editor's skepticism and perhaps irony is visible within this double game of image and text, which, in turn, goes a step further in Jaar's work, as the artist, by unveiling an episode censored from Kissinger's memoir through a photojournalistic record, directly underscores Kissinger's chameleon-like personality and the brutal consequences of his international policies in Chile.

Letelier's denunciation of the regime might have been familiar for an "obsessed" reader of the media and archivist like Jaar. Living in SoHo and having had his first New York exhibition at West Broadway's Cayman Gallery in 1983, Jaar might have been aware not only of the 1976 Letelier memorial exhibition at Cayman organized by Dore Ashton, but also of a large mural rendered in 1984 on West Broadway with the portrait of Letelier accompanied by those of Allende

and poet Pablo Neruda, the latter of who was assassinated two weeks after the coup. The mural, which was part of the public space exhibition *La Verdadera Avenida de las Americas* [The True Avenue of the Americas], was made in the context of a larger art endeavor entitled *Artists Call: Against U.S. Intervention in Central America*, led by art critic Lucy Lippard and the Institute of the Arts and Letters of El Salvador in Exile (INALSE). Jaar himself, invited by Lippard, participated in *Artists Call* through a collective show at the Colby College Museum of Art in Maine, in which the very mural of Letelier was reproduced in the form of a banner hanging from wall to wall.

Indeed, while the main focus of *Artists Call* was "to raise consciousness, to affect public opinion" regarding Reagan's "disastrous" international policies in Central America on the eve of the presidential elections in November, the Letelier mural/banner demonstrates that this large endeavor merging art and activism also involved other interventions begun before Reagan in South American countries such as Chile. which revealed the show's connection of



#### Figure 8.

Call and Response: Art on Central America (1984). Installation shot at the Colby College Museum of Art, Waterville, Maine. Courtesy of Colby College Museum of Art.

ASAP/Journal 368 |

the Reagan-era policies with a broader scope of victims and cultures affected by U.S. neocolonial practices during the Cold War.<sup>66</sup>

Similar to *Artists Call* in the early 1980s, Jaar's series on Kissinger was, and is, concerned with connecting shared histories of civic repression and human rights violations perpetuated by the U.S. in the so-called Third World. In *Buscando a Kissinger*, for instance, the text in Spanish suggests Kissinger's intervention in Chile and other Latin American countries, such as in Argentina's "Dirty War" (1974–1983). The same happens in a later work, *The Kissinger Project (Berlin)* (2012), where Jaar intervened three major newspapers published in Berlin with an advertising phrase reading "Arrest Kissinger's realpolitik (Figure 2). *Dear Mr. Jaar* is another significant early example of Jaar's concern with connecting shared histories of imperialism and violence in "underdeveloped" countries during the Cold War (Figure 9).

Made in 1984, the work is diptych of two prints created after Jaar found a 1973 photograph of Kissinger accompanied by a June 9, 1976 letter signed by the



#### Figure 9.

Alfredo Jaar, Dear Mr. Jaar (1976), (1984). Two pigment prints: 934 × 71/2 in. / 24.8 × 19 cm each. Courtesy of the artist.

San Martín 369 /

Secretary in a flea market in New York. Kissinger, wearing a gray suit, white T-shirt, and a checkered tie, poses for the camera and is elegantly illuminated by a lateral soft flash. With his face directed at the viewer and his eyes looking upward, Kissinger's mouth portrays a pleasant smile. This photograph was taken the same year as the Chilean coup, after Kissinger's involvement in the bombing of Cambodia and Laos and when he was controversially awarded the Nobel Peace Prize for his role in the Vietnam War. Indeed, this is the image commemorating that moment. For the second print, Jaar placed his own name as the recipient of a letter dated a month after Kissinger's speech at the OAS following his visit to Chile to personally inform Pinochet about U.S. support to the dictatorship. By choosing this particular photograph and by placing it next to a letter suggesting that Jaar had previously asked Kissinger for an autographed portrait, the artist ironically echoes the congratulatory tone of the regime-controlled media regarding a prized ally and celebrity. Yet its ironic take on the artist's own "obsession" with Kissinger serves to articulate Kissinger's own neocolonial involvement in world-historical transformation, connecting the cases of Chile, Cambodia, and Laos with Kissinger's 1973 Nobel Peace Prize and his 1976 visit to Chile.67

In turn, aware of Hersh's book, published a year before denouncing Kissinger's direct involvement in the Chilean dictatorship, in the early pieces of his project Jaar paralleled not only a cultural context seeking solidarity for and between cultures dominated by neocolonial powers, but also the presence of an aesthetics in which the names of victimizers and what they represented for dissident peoples were clearly manifested. The Letelier mural, for instance, included a quote extracted from his 1976 speech at the Felt Forum in Madison Square Garden in which he referred to the architects of the dictatorship as both "fascist" and "traitors." Indeed, to name names and therefore to denounce those complicit in the Chilean dictatorship has been, problematically, a mostly absent, even censored subject within the representation of memory during and after Pinochet's regime in Chile. As Chilean cultural critic Nelly Richard has observed, alongside the return of democracy in 1990, when Pinochet become senator-for-life with an amnesty law protecting him and former intelligence officers from being convicted for human rights violations, truth commissions, such as the Rettig Report, The National Commission for Truth and Reconciliation Report (1991) and the Valech Report, The National Commission on Political Imprisonment and Torture Report (2004), did not include the names of perpetrators; or if they did, as in the Valech case, the aim was not a definitive effort to bring military and

ASAP/Journal 370 /

more significantly, civic perpetrators to trial, either domestically or by universal jurisdiction.<sup>68</sup>

Protecting those who have benefited from the coup, these reports, Richard and other memory scholars and cultural critics note, have problematically advanced the neoliberal progressive paradigm aiming to close the book on the dictatorship, celebrating ideas of pardon and reconciliation and therefore embracing oblivion.<sup>69</sup> In line with Richard's observation, and informed by the people's demands in the public space and critical journalism, Jaar's project represents an ongoing search for those responsible for the crimes, showing the victimizer not as "victim of [his or her] circumstances" but as a "wanted" criminal sought by a democratic state. In so doing, he distances himself from a recent trend in Chile in which civic and cultural practices have turned memory into neoliberal practices of reconciliation and forgetfulness, providing the victimizer with Catholic pardon and regret.<sup>70</sup>

Jaar's practice of searching for K is, like the decolonial project more broadly, a necessarily ongoing, incomplete task. Put differently, Jaar's searching is itself a decolonial project that seeks to expose Kissinger's crimes in Chile and in other countries through the Global South as well as the fact that Kissinger has never been punished. He exposes a culture embracing oblivion for the sake of the marketplace, issuing a call-to-pursuit through representational acts whose aim is to dislodge this oblivion and to interfere in manipulation of public opinion. As Maldonado Torres writes, within "decolonial political, intellectual, and artistic expressions [there is] an increasingly self-conscious and coalitional effort to understanding decolonization, and not simply modernity, as an unfinished project."<sup>71</sup> Until Kissinger and the other perpetrators of the regime are imprisoned for their crimes, Jaar suggests, the families of the disappeared and the tortured, and human rights organizations and advocators will keep marching and demanding justice. So too will he keep adding more and more works to his series.

As Argentinian art historian Andrea Giunta has stated, Jaar's project seeks for a central aspect "of what every image related to the disappeared purports to achieve: that they appear alive; and that those responsible are brought to trial and punished for their crimes."<sup>72</sup> Among the numerous works of contemporary art that respond to and redress human rights abuses in the Global South, Jaar's project gives visual form to the voices of anti-imperialist, anti-colonialist, and anti-modernity protests throughout Latin America, with its calls of "*No a la impunidad*. *Ni perdón ni olvido*. *¡Juicio y castigo a todos los genocidas!*" [No to impunity. Neither forget nor forgive. Trial and punishment for those responsible]. In so doing, from the realm of aesthetics where the production knowledge and subjectivities are at stake, Jaar invites viewers to imagine that things could be otherwise, and to participate in solidarity in the decolonial idea that "*La lucha continua*" [The struggle continues].



<sup>1</sup> Enrique Dussel, *Philosophy of Liberation*, trans. Aquilina Martínez and Christine Morkovsky (1980; New York: Orbis, 1985), 1.

<sup>2</sup> Henry Kissinger, *White House Years* (Boston: Little Brown, 1979); and Henry Kissinger, *Years of Upheaval* (Boston: Little Brown, 1982).

<sup>3</sup> For more on this see, for example, James K Sebenius, R. Nicholas Burns, and Robert H Mnookin, *Kissinger the Negotiator: Lessons from Dealmaking at the Highest Level* (New York: Harper Collins, 2018); Jeremi Suri, *Henry Kissinger and the American Century* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2007); and Niall Ferguson, *Kissinger: 1923–1968: The Idealist* (New York: Penguin, 2015).

<sup>4</sup> Aníbal Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality," in "Globalization and the De-Colonial Option," ed. Walter D. Mignolo, special issue, *Cultural Studies* 21, no. 2–3 (2007): 168.

<sup>5</sup> Aníbal Quijano and Immanuel Wallerstein, "Americanity as a Concept; or, The Americas in the Modern World-System," *International Social Science Journal* 44, no. 4 (1992): 550.

<sup>6</sup> See Walter D. Mignolo, "La colonialidad, la cara oculta de la modernidad," in *Modernologías. Artistas contemporáneos investigan la modernidad y el modernismo*, ed. Sabine Breitwieser (Barcelona: Museu d'Art Contemporani de Barcelona, 2009), 39.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., 40–41.

<sup>8</sup> See Nelson Maldonado-Torres, "Thinking through the Decolonial Turn: Postcontinental Interventions in Theory, Philosophy, and Critique—An Introduction," *Transmodernity: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World* 1, no. 2 (Fall 2011): 1–2. For the constitutive relation between modernity and coloniality, see Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality"; and Quijano and Wallerstein, "Americanity as a Concept." See also Walter D. Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011).

ASAP/Journal 372 |

<sup>9</sup> See Bill Miller, "Family of Slain Chilean Sues Kissinger, Helms," *Washington Post*, September 11, 2001, https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/2001/09/11/family -of-slain-chilean-sues-kissinger-helms/2439f3a4-dfe0-418c-9454-de6052e4df55.

<sup>10</sup> For more on this, see Lubna Z. Qureshi, Nixon, Kissinger, and Allende: U.S. Involvement in the 1973 Coup in Chile (Lanham, MD: Lexington, 2009), 60–69.

<sup>11</sup> Zach Dorfman, "How Henry Kissinger Conspired Against a Sitting President," *Politico*, January 6, 2017, https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2017/01/henry-kissinger-jimmy-carter-chile-214603.

<sup>12</sup> Gary J. Bass, "Henry Kissinger Feels the Bern," *Politico*, February 12, 2016, https:// www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/02/henry-kissinger-bernie-sanders-hillary -clinton-debate-213626; and "Transcript of the Democratic Presidential Debate in Miami," *New York Times*, March 10, 2016, https://www.nytimes.com/2016/03/10/us/ politics/transcript-democratic-presidential-debate.html.

<sup>13</sup> Sarah Jackson and Victor Porcelli, "Henry Kissinger Told to 'Rot in Hell,' Disrupted Four Times During Talk at Stern," *Washington Square News*, October 16, 2018, https://nyunews.com/2018/10/16/10-17-news-kissinger/.

<sup>14</sup> "Kissinger the Negotiator," *Harvard Kennedy School—Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs*, May 8, 2018, https://www.belfercenter.org/publication/kissinger -negotiator-lessons-dealmaking-highest-level. See Sebenius, Burns, and Mnookin, *Kissinger the Negotiator*.

<sup>15</sup> Wolfgang Kaleck, "Arrest Kissinger!," *ECCHR Blog Post*, November 24, 2014, https://www.ecchr.eu/en/publication/arrest-kissinger/.

<sup>16</sup> See Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality"; and Quijano and Wallerstein, "Americanity as a Concept."

<sup>17</sup> Aníbal Quijano, "Colonialidade/Descolonialidade do Poder 1/5," YouTube video, 10:30, from a lecture in Asunción, Paraguay, August 2010, posted by "GRAP," October 25, 2010, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=slD-iPiGgmY.

<sup>18</sup> Alfredo Jaar, *Dore Ashton, You Know* (2015), YouTube video, 9:25, posted by "CAA," January 22, 2018, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sDPcYsT8Y6I.

<sup>19</sup> Roland Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. Richard Howard (1980; New York: Noonday Press, 1988), 96.

<sup>20</sup> John Dinges, "A Harsh Warning on Human Rights," TIME, June 21, 1976, 31.

<sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid.

<sup>23</sup> "Memorandum of Conversation: U.S.-Chilean Relations," *Department of State— Freedom of Information Act*, June 8, 1976. https://foia.state.gov//DOCUMENTS/StateChile3/ 0000579F.pdf.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

San Martín 373 /

<sup>25</sup> Henry Kissinger, Years of Renewal (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1999), 749; emphasis added. For more on the declassified documents of the U.S.-Chilean relations from the late 1960s through the 1980s, which resulted from Pinochet's detention in London, see Peter Kornbluh, *The Pinochet File: A Declassified Dossier on Atrocity and Accountability* (New York: New Press, 2004).

<sup>26</sup> La Tercera de la Hora (Santiago), June 10, 1976, Museo de la Memoria y los Derechos Humanos Archive; and *El Mercurio* (Santiago), June 9, 1976, Museo de la Memoria y los Derechos Humanos Archive. Unless otherwise noted, all translations are made by the author.

<sup>27</sup> Alfredo Jaar, in discussion with the author, August 15, 2016.

<sup>28</sup> Alfredo Jaar and Pirkko Siitari, "I need to understand the world before acting in the world," in *Tonight No Poetry Will Serve*, ed. Jari-Pekka Vanhala and Patrik Nyberg (Helsinki: Museum of Contemporary Art, Kiasma, 2015), 69.

<sup>29</sup> See Dinges, "Harsh Warning," 31; and "Memorandum of Conversation," June 8, 1976.

<sup>30</sup> Bernardo de la Masa, "Visita de Henry Kissinger a Chile—Parte 1—1976," YouTube video, 6:05, from a broadcast by Television Nacional de Chile in June 1976, posted by "TVN," November 12, 2015, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2bHSTUsHPHQ.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid.

<sup>32</sup> See Idelber Avelar, *The Untimely Present: Postdictatorial Latin American Fiction and the Task of Mourning* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999), 37–38.

<sup>33</sup> See "Memorandum for The 40 Committee: Basic Options on *El Mercurio*," *Department of State—Freedom of Information Act*, September 8, 1971, https://foia.state.gov// DOCUMENTS\NSCChile3\00009C55.pdf.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>35</sup> See Peter Kornbluh, "Nuevo informe de cita de Agustín Edwards con el jefe de la CIA devela su rol clave en el Golpe," *Ciper*, May 27, 2015, https://ciperchile.cl/2014/05/27/ nuevo-informe-de-cita-de-agustin-edwards-con-el-jefe-de-la-cia-devela-su-rol-clave -en-el-golpe/.

<sup>36</sup> Viron P. Vaky, "Memorandum for Dr. Kissinger: Chile—40 Committee Meeting," ,*Department of State—Freedom of Information Act*, September 14, 1970, https://foia.state.gov// DOCUMENTS\NSCChile3\0000956F.pdf; and Kornbluh, "Nuevo informe."

37 Ibid.

<sup>38</sup> "Meeting with President on Chile 9/1/1970," *Department of State—Freedom of Information Act*, September 15, 1970, https://foia.state.gov\\DOCUMENTS\PNARA3\000097BC.pdf.

<sup>39</sup> For more on the first coup plan, see Kornbluh, *Pinochet File*; and John Dinges, *The Condor Years: How Pinochet and His Allies Brought Terrorism to Three Continents* (New York: Norton, 2004).

<sup>40</sup> Quoted in Idelber Avelar, "Dictatorship and Immanence," *Journal of Latin American Cultural Studies* 7, no. 1 (1998): 75–76.

ASAP/Journal 374 |

41 Ibid.

42 Ibid.

<sup>43</sup> See Stanley Hoffmann, "The Kissinger Antimemoirs," *New York Times*, July 3, 1983, https://www.nytimes.com/1983/07/03/books/the-kissinger-antimemoirs.html.

<sup>44</sup> Quoted in Seymour M. Hersh, *The Price of Power: Kissinger in the Nixon White House* (New York: Summit, 1983), 263.

<sup>45</sup> Alfredo Jaar, in discussion with the author, April 8, 2019.

<sup>46</sup> Mignolo, Darker Side, 39.

<sup>47</sup> See Barthes, *Camera Lucida*, 96.

<sup>48</sup> See illustration captions in Henry Kissinger, *White House Years* (Boston: Little Brown, 1979); and Kissinger, *Years of Upheaval*. For more on Kissinger's involvement in Watergate, see Hersh, *Price of Power*.

<sup>49</sup> For more on this, see Diana Taylor, "Trauma, memoria y performance: Un recorrido por Villa Grimaldi con Pedro Matta," in "After Truth," ed. Jill Lane and Marcial Godoy-Anativia, special issue, *E-Misférica* 7, no 2 (2009), http://hemisphericinstitute.org/ hemi/en/e-misferica-72/taylor.

<sup>50</sup> Kissinger, Years of Upheaval, 374, 376.

<sup>51</sup> Jaar and Siitari, "I need to understandd," 69.

<sup>52</sup> Nikolaj Lübecker, "The Politics of Images," review of *Quand les images prennent position*, by Georges Didi-Huberman, and *Frames of War: When Is Life Grievable?*, by Judith Butler, *Paragraph* 36, no. 3 (November 2013): 392.

53 Ibid.

<sup>54</sup> Christopher Hitchens, *The Trial of Henry Kissinger* (New York: Twelve, 2012), 5.

<sup>55</sup> For more on this, see Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky, *Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media* (New York: Pantheon, 2002).

<sup>56</sup> For more on this, see Qureshi, Nixon, Kissinger, and Allende.

<sup>57</sup> For more on civilian complicity on the Chilean dictatorship, see Michael J. Lazzara, "Complicity and Responsibility in the Aftermath of the Pinochet Regime: The Case of *El Mocito*," in "Las declaraciones públicas de perpetradores: narrativas y conflictos en la memoria social en contextos de pos-guerra, pos-dictatoriales y pos-genocidas," ed. Claudia Field and Valentina Salvi, special issue, *Rúbrica contemporánea* 5, no. 9 (2016): 59–76. See also Javier Rebolledo, *A la sombra de los cuervos: Los cómplices civiles de la dictadura* (Santiago: Ceibo Ediciones, 2015); and Víctor Osorio and Iván Cabezas, *Los hijos de Pinochet* (Santiago: Planeta, 1995).

<sup>58</sup> Quoted in Greg Grandin, *Empire's Workshop: Latin America, the United States, and the Rise of the New Imperialism* (New York: Henry Holt, 2013), 175.

<sup>59</sup> In 1960s Chile, Anaconda and Kennecott Copper controlled the copper industry, and U.S.-based International Telephone and Telegraph (ITT) owned 70% of the Chilean phone company Chitelco and financed *El Mercurio*.

<sup>60</sup> "Junta Unleashes Indiscriminate Terror," in "Chile Under the Junta," special issue, USLA, Newsletter of the United States Committee for Justice to Latin American Political Prisoners 3, no. 10 (1973): 2, box 23, folder 7–8, Lucy R. Lippard Papers, 1930s–2007, bulk 1960–1990, Archives of American Art, Smithsonian Institution.

61 See Kornbluh, "Nuevo informe."

<sup>62</sup> For more on Letelier's assassination, see John Dinges and Saul Landau, *Assassination on Embassy Row* (New York: Pantheon, 1980); and Dinges, *Condor Years*.

63 Ibid.

<sup>64</sup> See Pascale Bonnefoy, "C.I.A. Believed Pinochet Ordered 1976 Assassination in U.S., Memo Reveals," *New York Times*, October 9, 2015, https://www.nytimes.com/2015/10/10/world/americas/cia-believed-pinochet-ordered-1976-assassination-in-us -memo-reveals.html.

<sup>65</sup> "Memorandum of Conversation," June 8, 1976.

<sup>66</sup> For more on *Artists Call*, see PAD/D Archive, The Museum of Modern Art, New York, http://arcade.nyarc.org/search~S8.

<sup>67</sup> Alfredo Jaar, "It is difficult" (presentation, Palestine at/without the Museum: Loss, Metaphor and Emancipation conference, Barcelona, Spain, February 21, 2015), https://www.macba.cat/en/audio-palestine-alfredo-jaar.

<sup>68</sup> See Nelly Richard, *Crítica de la memoria: 1990–2010* (Santiago: Ediciones UDP, 2010).

<sup>69</sup> Ibid. See also Lazzara, "Complicity and Responsibility"; and Rebolledo, A la sombra.

<sup>70</sup> For more on this, see Michael J. Lazzara, *Luz Arce and Pinochet's Chile: Testimony in the Aftermath of State Violence* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011).

<sup>71</sup> Nelson Maldonado-Torres, "Thinking through the Decolonial Turn: Postcontinental Interventions in Theory, Philosophy, and Critique—An Introduction," *Transmodernity: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World* 1, no. 2 (2011): 2.

<sup>72</sup> Andrea Giunta, "Politics of Representation: Art and Human Rights," in "After Truth," ed. Jill Lane and Marcial Godoy-Anativia, special issue, *E-Misférica* 7, no 2. (2009), http://hemisphericinstitute.org/hemi/en/e-misferica-72/giunta.

ASAP/Journal 376 |